

## PROJECT SUMMARY:

The City of Watertown is requesting funding through the NYS Office of Parks Recreation and Historic Preservation for the *Soldiers and Sailors Monument Restoration Project*. The project will involve the cleaning and restoration of the Soldiers and Sailors Monument located in downtown Watertown in the Public Square Historic District (1984). The monument was erected in 1891 in honor of Civil War veterans and is the oldest and one of only two historically significant pieces of public art located in the historic district. While the monument is structurally sound, nearly 120 years of exposure to the elements has taken its toll. The grant funding will allow for the cleaning of all masonry surfaces, the repairing of deteriorating mortar joints and the cleaning and waxing of the bronze surfaces. This project is the last significant piece to the Public Square Streetscape Project and will complete the visual revitalization of the downtown area.

## PROJECT OVERVIEW:

The Soldiers and Sailors Monument is situated on an elliptical shaped island known as Public Square Park, a landscaped public space located in the heart of Watertown. Public Square dates to 1805 when the first settlers to the region established homes and businesses in the area. Over the years, Public Square has been the center for banking, insurance, retail, medical services, restaurants and hotels. Although some of the uses have changed over the years, Public Square has remained the center of the regional travel for over two hundred years. Public Square is one of the heaviest traveled thoroughfares in the County and is the crossroads of eight City streets including Washington St., Franklin St., State St., Factory St, Mill St., Black River Parkway, Court St. and Arsenal St. (See USGS Map, Attachment B-1)

The City of Watertown is the owner of Public Square Park, within which the Soldiers and Sailors Monument is located. As is noted above, the park dates to 1805 when eight men, led by early settlers Henry Coffeen and Zachariah Butterfield deeded the land for public use. Since this happened so early in the history of the Watertown, no official deed or record of the transaction is on record. However, this area is depicted on the City's tax maps as located within the City owned right-of-way. (See Copy of Tax Map, Attachment B-2)

The City is proposing a cleaning and restoration project that will bring the Soldiers and Sailors Monument back to its original beauty. With nearly 120 years passing since its original installation and little or no maintenance or care occurring during that time period, the monument is definitely in need of attention. Mortar joints on the limestone block base are deteriorating and in need of repair. Biological and metallic staining has occurred on various areas of the monument and needs to be properly cleaned. The bronze figures have active corrosion on the surface that threatens their long term stability which has to be addressed through cleaning, repatination and waxing.

The Soldiers and Sailors Monument Restoration Project is the final component of the Downtown Watertown Streetscape Enhancement Project. The Streetscape project began in 1999 when the City successfully applied for funding through the NYS DOT's Transportation Enhancement Program. The preliminary designs for the Streetscape Project included a new central plaza area in Public Square Park, new channelizing traffic islands, improved crosswalks and other surface enhancements but the project was soon expanded to include such items as paving and utility enhancements.

Expanding the scope meant expanding the budget, and the City was able to successfully obtain additional funding through the NYS Senate Multi-Modal Program, the Community Capital Assistance Program, the NYS Assembly Community Enhancement Facilities Assistance Program, the Consolidated Highway Improvement Program (CHIPS), Main Street New York funding from Empire State Development Corp. and High Priority Project funds through the Federal Safe, Accountable, Flexible, Efficient Transportation Equity Act: A Legacy for Users (SAFETEA-LU).

The discussions of expanding the scope of the original streetscape project included consideration of restoring the Soldiers and Sailors Monument as part of the project; however the funding sources never seemed

to align correctly with the project scope. Many of the grants that the City received were for specific project components such as storm sewer replacement or for signage. The City hoped to use extra High Priority Project funds from SAFETEA-LU to pay for the restoration, but delays resulted in increases in the project cost and the grant funds were completely used. While there was not enough funding to restore the monument, the project did include the construction of 5' wide sidewalks from the central plaza area of Public Square Park all the way around the perimeter of the Monument to provide pedestrian access that was not available before. This EPF funding will enable the City to complete the final component of the Streetscape Enhancement Project, the restoration of the Soldiers and Sailors Monument.

## **PROGRAM IMPACT:**

The Soldiers and Sailors Monument is located in the Public Square Historic District. Nominated for inclusion on the National Register of Historic Places in 1984, the district is located in the heart of downtown Watertown and encompasses the City's only concentration of intact historic commercial architecture. It is comprised of over 50 buildings of various styles and significance including Italianate, Richardsonian Romanesque, Colonial Revival and Neoclassical. Public Square Park is located in the center of the district and includes the Monument, an ornamental fountain dating to 1869, a replica gazebo, flagpole, trees and other elements.

The Soldiers and Sailors Monument was erected in the late nineteenth century to honor the efforts of local Civil War veterans. The project began when Mr. and Mrs. George Cook donated \$10,000 in 1889 to kick off a community fund raising campaign. The design of the monument was completed thereafter by American sculptor Henry Augustus Lukeman and architect Edward Pearce Casey. The cornerstone was laid on May 30, 1890 and the construction was completed in 1891.

The Monument stands approximately fifty feet tall measured from its coursed rubble stone foundation to the very top. The base is comprised of three separate pieces of solid granite. On top of the base is the plinth (a square block beneath a column). The plinth consists of cyma and a four sided die measuring six feet tall and six feet wide. At this level on the north and south sides of the monument stand life sized bronze statues of a soldier and a sailor. Above the plinth is an octagonal shaped granite shaft that is capped with a crenellated turret and an unfluted shaft. Above the unfluted column there is a crenellated capital topped by the over life sized figure of Victory. (*See Schematic Site Plan, Attachment B-3 and Project Photos, Attachment B-4*)

The Monument has graced the west end of Public Square since 1891, standing witness to the rise and fall of buildings, changes in traffic patterns and the rebuilding of roads and sidewalks. During the 119 years that the monument has stood, very little documentation of any previous treatment history has surfaced. The only item of note is an article from the *Watertown Daily Times* from July of 1937, when the monument was 46 years old that states that the monument had been restored to its original beauty. No further details appear in the article regarding the exact treatment that occurred at the time.

Today, an inspection of the Soldiers and Sailors Monument reveals an unmaintained appearance of failing mortar joints, staining on the stone work and active corrosion of the surface of the bronze sculptures and features. The failing mortar joints in particular, along with the corroding bronze statues prompted the City of Watertown to commission Conservation Solutions, Inc., a nationally known firm specializing in the treatment of historic and artistic works of art to conduct an assessment of the monument to determine its condition and to develop a scope of work to properly restore it. The result of their work is a conditions assessment report. (*See Copy of the Conditions Assessment Report of the Soldiers and Sailors Monument, Attachment B-5*)

The conditions assessment report details that structurally, the monument is in good condition. During their inspection, Conservation Solutions, Inc. placed a level on each tier of the monument to determine if it was out of level and leaning in a particular direction. It was also monitored using a transit level. As a result of the investigation, the monument was not found to be leaning in any direction.

Despite being relatively level, the monument is in desperate need of attention to correct significant problems that have developed over time. Probably the most obvious problem is the condition of the mortar joints in the stone foundation. The mortar joints in the foundation range in width from  $\frac{3}{4}$ " – 1  $\frac{1}{2}$ " and their condition is poor. Approximately one-third of the pointing mortar is missing and a significant portion of the bedding mortar (1-2 inches) has also been lost. There are also lead joints in between the various granite blocks that are in poor condition. The existing lead is deteriorating, displaced or missing.

The granite stonework also shows signs of atmospheric and biological soiling in several areas. There is black soiling in the recesses around the various joints and in the paths where water run-off occurs. Moss is growing in the wider joints of the foundation. Soiling is more prevalent on the north and west sides of the monument as those areas receive less sunlight and stay damp longer. On the north side of the granite base a calcite run has developed. This staining is caused as water, carrying minerals, washes through a joint in between the second and third tiers of the base. The minerals are deposited and a stain develops as the water runs to the stone below. For pictures of the above conditions, see the previously referenced project photos.

Metallic staining has also occurred on the monument. Copper staining has occurred directly below the bronze statues and plaques. The staining is visible as a light blue-green color on the face of the stone. Iron staining has also occurred at various locations. On the upper level of the structure, just below the statue of Victory, significant iron staining has occurred from the presence of an iron chain that has been wrapped around the monument. An iron shim used to level the bronze sailor is also causing staining just below his foot.

The bronze soldier and sailor on the south and north elevations of the monument are showing significant signs of deterioration. Active corrosion of the bronze surface is visible through a pale green appearance, streaking and pitting of the surface. These corrosion products are unsightly and destructive to the bronze pieces. If left untreated, the statues will continue to be eroded to the point where a catastrophic failure could occur. The dedication plaques on the east and west elevations are also showing signs of deterioration and need to be properly maintained. For pictures of the above conditions, see the previously referenced project photos.

The Soldiers and Sailors Monument today is unfortunately an unmaintained piece of public art, epitomized by failing mortar joints, staining on the stone work and active corrosion of the surface of the bronze sculptures and features. A significant scope of work has to be undertaken in order to restore the monument to its original beauty. The proposed scope of work needed to restore the Soldiers and Sailors Monument will include cleaning of the masonry surfaces, removal of metallic stains, masonry repairs, repair of mortar and lead joints and cleaning and treatment of the bronze features.

The detailed cleaning, restoration and repair specifications are listed on pages 12-15 of the previously referenced Conditions Assessment Report. In general, all work will conform to the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties and the American Institute for Conservation of Historic and Artistic Works Code of Ethics and Guidelines for Practice.

The proposed work will ensure the long term protection of the monument by stabilizing and repairing the deteriorating joints to maintain the structural stability of the monument. The various cleaning procedures will improve the monument aesthetically, but more importantly will significantly slow or stop further deterioration of the bronze and the staining of the various elements. There are no proposed ground disturbance activities as all of the restoration will be above grade. Therefore no archeological protection measures are proposed or required for the project.

The property and site has always been part of the City's street right-of-way and has been used either for street purposes or as the home for the monument. The site will continue to be used for this purpose. The site has been and will continue to be maintained by the City of Watertown as a small park. Maintenance thereof will be funded by the City and performed by the Department of Public Works.

The Monument has been the cornerstone to Public Square Park and the entire downtown area for over a

century. It is a lasting tribute to the soldiers and sailors who fought and died in the Civil War. In many ways it is a tribute to all of the men and women who have fought and died for our country in numerous wars throughout our history. Being a military community with the presence of the 10<sup>th</sup> Mountain Division and Fort Drum, preserving this history and the monument's legacy for generations to come is so critical and representative of the importance of the military to our community and the nation.

## **PLANNING:**

As is noted above, the City has been involved with extensive planning, design and implementation of the Downtown Watertown Streetscape Enhancement Project since 1999. The main purpose of the project is to enhance the aesthetics of the downtown area to encourage revitalization. A component of the project has been the restoration of the Soldiers and Sailors Monument, but because of financial concerns, this portion of the project has not been able to be implemented. Extensive community participation and public outreach has occurred for the streetscape project through public meetings, presentations and media coverage.

Another related planning effort undertaken by the City has been the development of a Local Waterfront Revitalization Program for the Black River. Through a series of community visioning workshops and public meetings, the community has identified developing a linkage between Public Square and the waterfront as a critical project in terms of the long-term success of the waterfront and also as a way to build momentum for the continued revitalization and success of businesses along Public Square. The connection between the downtown and the river will only be enhanced through the implementation of this project. *(See Highlighted Copy of the City's Draft Local Waterfront Revitalization Program, Attachment B-6)*

The project also has support from the Governor Roswell P. Flower Monument Centennial Committee. This grass roots committee was formed in 2002 and was able to raise funds for the restoration of the 1903 Roswell P. Flower Monument located on Washington Street in the downtown. *(See the attached letters of support from committee members and letters from other local officials, Attachment B-7)*

Finally, the SEQR for this project has been completed. *(See SEQR Compliance Documentation, Attachment B-8)*

## **PROJECT EMPHASIS:**

This project will have a significant regional impact on the greater Watertown community. Watertown has a strong military presence in the area from the 10<sup>th</sup> Mountain Division and Fort Drum. The monument is a beautiful piece of public art and an important part of our history as it represents the soldiers and sailors who gave their lives for the freedom of all. The preservation of the monument and the history it represents for future generations is essential to the community.

This project meets three of the four funding priorities for 2010 established by the Commissioner as follows: 1.) The project will promote the coordination and pooling of capital resources between the State, the City and private individuals who have donated money toward the proposed project. With the possible formal organization of a private group to raise additional funds for the project (see detail below), the public/private partnership will expand and grow significantly as the project progresses. 2.) The project will complete a multi-phased or long term project by completing the Downtown Watertown Streetscape Enhancement Project. As noted above, this project has been in the planning, design and implementation phase for over 10 years and this project is the final piece of the streetscape enhancement puzzle planned for downtown. 3.) The entire streetscape enhancement project focused on downtown revitalization and this project is one more piece to completing the visual revitalization of the downtown area.

## **REASONABLENESS OF COST:**

Upon execution of a grant agreement with the State for the project, the City Planning Office will

develop a Request for Proposals (RFP) to be issued to qualified monument conservators for the restoration and cleaning of the Soldiers and Sailors Monument. The scope of work in the RFP will be developed using the information provided in the Conditions Assessment Report that was completed for the Monument in 2009 (the report was previously discussed above). The report is key to the project and represents a significant amount of preliminary work that has already been completed. The City will be able to maintain the project schedule and proceed quickly with its implementation and completion because a majority of the information needed for the RFP is already in place.

After the submission of proposals from various conservators, a Selection Committee will be formed consisting of members of the community with experience with these types of projects and employees of the City of Watertown. The selection committee will review the various proposals and rate them based on the following criteria: 1. Proposal presentation and overall organization. 2. Overall education and experience of the conservator (resume) 3. Conservator's experience in completing projects of similar size and complexity. 4. Evaluation of completed works (as illustrated in photographs and supporting statement). 5. Understanding of proposed project & ability to complete project on time. After rating each of the proposals, the Committee will then meet to discuss the proposals and make a final selection for the conservator.

The RFP process will be qualifications based and will follow all applicable procurement requirements. The RFP will be completed by the City at no cost to the project. The City has successfully utilized this process with the conservation of the Roswell P. Flower Monument in 2003.

After the selection of a successful contractor, work on the monument cleaning and restoration will begin. Construction oversight and inspection will be performed by City Staff. Work on the monument will include the cleaning and repair of the masonry, stonework, bronze statues and plaques, minor landscaping and project documentation. Details of the proposed cleaning and restoration are provided in Part C, Project Schedule and in the Conditions Assessment Report, previously referenced as Attachment B-2.

The RFP process, construction oversight and grant management will be handled by Michael A. Lumbis. Mr. Lumbis has a Bachelor of Landscape Architecture from the SUNY College of Environmental Science and Forestry and has been a Planner with the City for 17 years. His experience includes working in various phases of planning and project development including design, project management, oversight and grant administration. His experience includes serving as the project manager for the \$7.1 million Downtown Watertown Streetscape Enhancement Project completed in 2008 and project manager for the Governor Roswell P. Flower Monument Conservation Project completed in 2003. Mr. Lumbis has also been the project manager on several OPRHP grant projects including the Waterworks Park Trail Extension Project and the Black River Parks Development Project. The fiscal accounting for the project will be led by the City Comptroller, James E. Mills, CPA. Mr. Mills has a Bachelor's degree in Accounting from SUNY Oswego. He has served as the City Comptroller for the City of Watertown since September 2002.

The total timeframe for the project is 16 months from the date that an executed agreement between the City and State is received. During months 0-6, a request for proposals will be developed by the City and issued to qualified monument conservators. Proposals will then be reviewed and a conservator will be selected and brought under contract with the City. Months 6-12 are scheduled for the actual field work, to include masonry and stonework repairs, bronze statue and plaque repair and landscaping. Months 6-14 will include the conservation oversight and management by the conservator, and project documentation. Grant administration will occur between months 0-16, while site supervision by the City will occur during months 6-12. The CPA Audit report will be completed and submitted at the conclusion of the project during months 14-16.

The estimated project costs as shown in Part C were developed as part of the Conditions Assessment Report completed by Conservation Solutions, Inc. (CSI) in 2009. In addition to evaluating the condition of the monument and providing a proposed work scope, CSI provided estimated costs for various project elements. (See *Copy of the Soldiers and Sailors Monument – Budgetary Cost Estimate, Attachment C-1*) CSI provided a price for the masonry treatment (\$120,000), bronze treatment (\$25,000), and conservation oversight, project

management and documentation (\$25,000). As is noted in the estimate, the listed prices are 2009 rates and are subject to a 5% inflation rate. In addition, the price did not include provisions for prevailing wage rates. In order to accommodate for inflation (5%) and additional costs associated with wage rates (10%), a total of 15% was added to each of the items listed above. The revised totals for each category are therefore \$138,000 for the masonry treatment, \$28,750 for the bronze treatment and \$28,750 for the conservation oversight, project management and documentation. Landscaping costs of \$2,250 were also added to the estimate and were based on previous project experience. A total of \$1,250 was included in the project cost for the CPA Audit Report based on an estimate provided by our City Comptroller. Finally, \$1,000 is included in the project budget for signage as described in Part C. The total project cost is therefore \$200,000. Since the City is located in an area where poverty rates exceed 10%, we are requesting 75% of the total project cost or \$150,000 in this application.

As was noted above in the Project Emphasis portion of the narrative, there has already been a small, private, individual donation made to the City to help pay for the restoration of the Soldiers and Sailors Monument. Additionally, there are several Watertown citizens who have expressed an interest in conducting a fundraising campaign on behalf of the City to pay for a portion of the cleaning, restoration costs and long term maintenance costs. The volunteer group would reach out to veterans groups such as local American Legions and VFW posts, Fort Drum related organizations and the community at large to raise funds for the project. Although this is in a preliminary stage at this point, this potential private sector involvement is a real possibility. The City would be delighted to have such an effort organized on its behalf as it would give the community a sense of ownership in the project and would resemble the effort of the local citizenry when the monument was originally erected in 1891. It may also offset some of the City's match and provide for a fund for the long term maintenance and care of the monument.

Even without the private donations, the City Council has authorized this application and is prepared to provide the required \$50,000 applicant share. The cash match will be allocated from the City's General Fund in the 2011-2012 budget. The City currently has a \$36 Million General Fund budget and has the ability to pay for the entire cost of the project in advance and then seek reimbursement as will be required.

In summary, the Soldiers and Sailors Monument Restoration Project is an important project that needs the assistance of the NYS OPRHP to make it a reality. The project has wide spread community support. With the strong military presence in our community from the 10<sup>th</sup> Mountain Division at Fort Drum the restoration of the monument is important as it represents the effort and sacrifice of soldiers and sailors who fought and died in the Civil War. The monument was erected in 1891 and is the oldest and one of only two historically significant pieces of public art located in the historic district. This project is the last significant piece to the Public Square Streetscape Project and will bring the Soldiers and Sailors Monument back to its original beauty so that future generations can remember the past and enjoy it for years to come.